Is something missing?

(1)  a. He bought something, but I don’t know what.
    b. Someone made a mess in the kitchen guys, and gee, I wonder who.
    c. There’s one of your students in the office, but I can’t tell which.
    d. He bought a painting of something. It was unclear (of) what.

A starter question:

• Is it deep or surface—syntactically or pragmatically controlled?

But is there independent evidence for syntactic deletion or not?

(2) He invited someone, but I don’t know
    a. \[ DP \text{ who } \] no deletion; just a wh-word
    b. \[ CP \text{ who he invited} \] question with deletion of rest of CP

Maybe nothing is missing

Why not just a simple complement, like (2-a)? In fact, just a simple DP can sometimes give what seems like the meanings we’re after here.

(3) a. I know the capitals of Europe ≈ I know what the capitals of Europe are.
    b. I asked the time. ≈ I asked what the time was.

(4) a. He invited some people, but he didn’t tell me \[ DP \text{ the people he invited} \].
    b. He invited some people, but he didn’t tell me \[ DP \text{ who} \]

(5) a. He bought the car for a lot of money, but I never knew \[ the price \].
    b. He bought the car for a lot of money, but I never knew \[ how much \].
(6) a. They had left, and I asked [ the reason ].
b. They had left, and I asked [ why ].

What about these?

(7) a. I had no idea what the capital of Saskatchewan is
b. *I had no idea the capital.

(8) a. I inquired what time it was.
b. *I inquired the time.

(9) a. I wondered who she invited
b. *I wondered the invitees.

(10) Sal invited someone . . .
a. I don’t know who.
b. I wondered who.
c. I inquired who.
d. She told me who.
e. I had no idea who.

(11) Sally invited someone.
a. I know who, but I don’t know him.
b. #I know him, but I don’t know him.

(12) Predictions for languages with different ‘knows’?

3 CP vs. DP position

(13) [Dass Elke ein Auto repariert hat] haben wir gewusst, aber . . .
that Elke a car repaired has have we known but
‘We knew that Elke repaired a car, but . . .’
a. wir haben nicht geahnt, [welches].
we have not suspected which.
‘we had no idea which.’
c. *wir haben nicht [welches] geahnt.

(14) a. Wann hat [das auto] Elke gestern repariert?
when has the car Elke yesterday repaired
‘When did Elke repair the car yesterday?’
b. *Wann hat Elke gestern repariert [das Auto]?
when has Elke yesterday repaired the car
‘When did Elke fix the car yesterday’
(15) a. Wann hat Elke gestern welches Auto repariert?
   When did Elke fix what car yesterday?
   ‘When did Elke fix what car yesterday?’
b. *Wer hat gestern repariert welches Auto?
   Who fixed which car yesterday?
   ‘Who fixed which car yesterday?’
c. *Wann hat welches Auto Elke gestern repariert?
   When has which car Elke yesterday repaired
   ‘When did Elke fix which car yesterday?’

(16) a. Wir haben nicht gewusst [CP welches Auto Elke repariert hat]
   we have not known which car Elke repaired has
   ‘We don’t know which car Elke repaired,’
   ‘We don’t know which car Elke repaired,’
   ‘We don’t know which car Elke repaired,’

4 What kinds of CPs

What other kinds of CPs are there? Do they allow parts of them to go missing in a similar way?

Some questions to think about:

(17) a. Does there need to be a wh-phrase?
b. Will any kind of wh-phrase do?
c. Does it need to be a question?
d. Does any kind of question do?

5 OK, it’s a CP but where did the wh-word come from?

Construct an argument about where the wh-word originates using the following. (NOM = nominative case; ACC = dative case; DAT = dative case)

(18) a. Sie wissen nicht, {*wer /*wen /*wem} er schmeicheln will.
   they know not who.NOM /who.ACC /who.DAT he flatter wants
   ‘They don’t know who he wants to flatter.’
b. Sie wissen nicht, {*wer /*wen /*wem} er loben will.
   they know not who.NOM /who.ACC /who.DAT he praise wants
   ‘They don’t know who he wants to praise.’

(19) a. Er will jemandem schmeicheln, aber sie wissen nicht, {*wer /*wen /*wem}.
   he wants someone.DAT flatter but they know not who.NOM who.ACC who.DAT
   ‘He wants to flatter someone, but they don’t know who.’
b. Er will jemanden loben, aber sie wissen nicht, {*wer /*wen /*wem}.
   he wants someone.ACC praise but they know not who.NOM /who.ACC /who.DAT
   ‘He wants to flatter someone, but they don’t know who.’
And again with these:

(20)  a. Who was she talking with?
     b. With who(m) was she talking?

(21)  Mary was talking to someone,
      a. but I don’t know who.
      b. but I don’t know with whom.

(22)  Basque
      a. Nor  ekin hitzegin zuen?
          who with talk-to  AUX
          ‘With whom did he talk with?’
      b. *Nor  hitzegin zuen _____ ekin.
          who talk-to  AUX   with
          ‘Who did he talk with?’

(23)  Basque\(^1\)
      a. Ana-k  norbait ekin hitzegin zuen, baina ez  dakit nor  ekin.
          Ana-ERG someone with talk.to  AUX, but  not know who with
          ‘Ana spoke to someone, but I don’t know with whom.’
      b. *Ana-k  norbait ekin hitzegin zuen, baina ez  dakit nor.
          Ana-ERG someone with talk.to  AUX, but  not know who
          ‘Ana spoke to someone, but I don’t know who.’

(24)  German
      a. Anna hat mit  jemandem gesprochen, aber ich weiss nicht, *(mit) wem.
          Anna has with someone spoken  but  I  know not  with  who
          ‘Anna has spoken with someone, but I don’t know who?‘
      b. *Wem hat sie  mit  gesprochen?
          who  has she with spoken
          ‘Who has she spoken with?‘

(25)  Norwegian
      a. Per har snakket med noen,  men jeg vet  ikke (med) hvem.
          Per has talked  with someone but  I  know not  with  who
          ‘Per has spoken with someone, but I don’t know (with) who
      b. Hvem har Per snakket med?
          who   has Per with  spoken with
          ‘Who has Per spoken with?’

6 Some extras

(26)  a. *He bought a painting, but I don’t know who.
     b. *There is a mess in the kitchen, guys, and gee, I wonder who.

\(^1\)ERG = ergative, a suffix for subjects of verbs with objects
c. *There are students in the office, but I can’t tell which.
d. *He bought a painting. It was unclear (of) what.

(27)   a. Sally’s out hunting—guess what?
b. He bought something, but I don’t know when.
c. They chose leather. It’s pretty clear why.
d. John’s serving his guests now, but I don’t know what.
e. compare: John is serving some paella, but I don’t know *(to) whom.